

these words and sent them to the most pious emperor.¹⁸⁸ Have his autograph letter read, so that the whole council may say that it was accepted deservedly.’

268. The most glorious officials and the exalted senate said: ‘Why then did you depose Flavian of devout memory?’

269. Eustathius the most devout bishop of Berytus said: ‘I erred.’

Veronicianus the hallowed secretary of the divine consistory read from the same document:

(Constantinople)

270. After the reading¹⁸⁹ Eusebius the most devout bishop of Dorylaeum said: ‘Since I am convinced that these are my beliefs and since I present myself as the adversary of those who try to exploit them to corrupt the doctrine of orthodoxy, I have come to your holy synod and ask your holiness also to assent to what has been read, so that all may know that whoever rejects these statements of faith is the enemy of the orthodox church and has no part in the priestly assembly.’

271. The most holy Archbishop Flavian said: ‘It is both most pious and necessary for us to agree with what has been correctly defined, for who can oppose the words of the Holy Spirit? The letters that have been read of our father Cyril of blessed memory and [now] among the saints, then bishop of the most holy church of Alexandria, give an accurate interpretation of the thought of the holy fathers who assembled in their time at Nicaea, and they teach us what we hold and have always held, that our Lord Jesus Christ, the only-begotten son of God, is perfect God and perfect man made up of a rational soul and body, begotten from the Father without beginning before the ages in respect of the Godhead, and the same at the end and in the last times for us and for our salvation born from Mary the Virgin in respect of the manhood, consubstantial with the Father in respect of the Godhead and consubstantial with his mother in respect of the manhood. For we confess that Christ is from two natures after the incarnation, as we confess in one hypostasis and one person one Christ, one Son,

188 The reference is to the Letter of Flavian to Theodosius II of December 448 (*ACO* 2.1 p. 35), in which the Christological formula he had used at the Home Synod of 448 (271 below) was supplemented by the statement, ‘We do not refuse to affirm one nature of God the Word, enfleshed and incarnate, since from both is one and the same our Lord Jesus Christ’ (lines 20–22). At the Home Synod Flavian had insisted on a ‘two nature’ formula (see p. 116 above), but by December he was trying to mend fences with the miaphysites.

189 Of the two canonical letters of Cyril (at 240, 246).

one Lord. Those who choose a different belief we exclude from the holy assembly of priests and the whole body of the church. Each of the most God-beloved bishops here present should record his beliefs and his faith in the text of the minutes.’¹⁹⁰

(Chalcedon)

272. During the reading the most glorious officials and the exalted senate said: ‘What say the most devout bishops of the present holy council? In so expounding the faith did Flavian of sacred memory preserve the orthodox and catholic religion, or did he make some mistake in its regard?’

273. Paschasinus the most devout bishop, representing the apostolic see, said: ‘Flavian of blessed memory gave a pure and comprehensive exposition of the faith. His faith and exposition accords with the letter of that most blessed and apostolic man the bishop of Rome.’

274. After this statement had been translated into Greek by Constantine the hallowed secretary of the divine consistory,¹⁹¹ Anatolius the most devout archbishop of Constantinople said: ‘The blessed Flavian gave a fine and orthodox exposition of the faith of our holy fathers.’

275. Lucentius the most devout bishop, representing the apostolic see, said: ‘Since the faith of Flavian of blessed memory is in harmony with the apostolic see and the patristic traditions, it is just that the most holy council should transfer to the heretics the condemnation which they decreed against him.’

276. After this statement had been translated into Greek by Constantine the hallowed secretary of the divine consistory,¹⁹² Maximus the most devout bishop of Antioch in Syria said: ‘Archbishop Flavian of sacred memory gave an exposition of the faith that was orthodox and in harmony with the most God-beloved and sacred Archbishop Leo, and we all accept it eagerly.’

277. Thalassius the most devout bishop of Caesarea in Cappadocia said: ‘Flavian of blessed memory spoke in accord with Cyril of blessed memory.’

278. Eusebius the most devout bishop of Ancyra in Galatia said: ‘We

190 Flavian’s profession of faith is based on the Formula of Reunion, contained in the letter of Cyril of Alexandria read at 246. The distinction that Flavian makes between ‘two natures’ and ‘one hypostasis’ was novel (since hitherto the two terms had not been distinguished in this way) and was adopted in the Chalcedonian Definition (V. 34).

191 We follow the Latin version. This clause is omitted by some Greek MSS and inserted by others at the beginning of 273.

192 Here again, as at 274, we follow the Latin version. This clause is placed by those Greek MSS that include it at the beginning of 275.

approve and accept the statement on religion of the most sacred Flavian.'

279. Eustathius the most devout bishop of Berytus said: 'The then archbishop of the imperial city, Flavian, most God-beloved in memory, followed the teachings of our most blessed and holy father Cyril, then bishop of Alexandria.'

280. The most devout Oriental bishops and those with them exclaimed: 'The martyr Flavian gave a fine exposition of the faith. Archbishop Flavian gave a fine exposition of the faith.'

281. Dioscorus the most devout bishop of Alexandria said: 'Let the rest of his words be read, and then I will answer. He will be found in what follows to contradict himself and speak of two natures after the union.'

282. Juvenal the most devout bishop of Jerusalem said: 'The most holy Bishop Flavian spoke in harmony with the statements of Cyril blessed in memory, but we ask for the reading of what follows, in order to make his thought more clear.'

283. The most devout bishops from Palestine said: 'We say the same as the most sacred Archbishop Juvenal.'

284. Standing up, the most devout Juvenal with these bishops crossed over to the other side.¹⁹³

285. The most devout Oriental bishops and those with them exclaimed: 'God has led you well, orthodox one. You are welcome.'

286. Peter the most devout bishop of Corinth said: 'I was not present then at the council of Ephesus – for I had not yet {by the grace of God}¹⁹⁴ been appointed a bishop –, but from what has been read I find that the words of Flavian of blessed memory emulate the teaching of Cyril of holy memory, and so I hesitate to criticize them. The reading of the rest will instruct me more fully.'

287. Standing up, he too crossed over to the other side.

288. The most devout Oriental bishops and those with them exclaimed: 'Peter thinks like Peter. Orthodox one, you are welcome.'

289. Irenaeus the most devout bishop of Naupactus in Hellas said: 'I too was not present at the recent holy council at Ephesus, and after the reading to us just now of the teaching of Flavian of sacred memory I hesitate to criticize him, and ask that the rest be read.'

193 See 4 for the seating order at the beginning of the session, with Dioscorus' supporters arrayed on one side of the nave. His Palestinian supporters now desert him, to be followed by his supporters from Illyricum and even by four Egyptian bishops (293–6).

194 These words are present in the Latin version and one important Greek MS.

290. The other most devout bishops of Hellas¹⁹⁵ said: 'We teach the same about what has been read.'

And they all crossed over to the other side.

291. Quintillus, Sozon and the other most devout bishops of Macedonia and Crete said: 'We do not find anything anomalous in the statement of Flavian of sacred memory that has been read, and we ask that the rest be read.'

292. Nicholas the most devout bishop of Stobi in Macedonia said: 'I was not present at the aforesaid council, but from what has been read I do not find that Flavian of blessed memory said anything contrary to the definitions of the most blessed fathers and the most blessed Cyril.'

293. Athanasius the most devout bishop of Busiris of Tripolis in Egypt said: 'The most holy Bishop Flavian followed the letters of the most sacred Cyril, and expounded the faith well.'¹⁹⁶

294. Auxonius the most devout bishop of Sebennytus said: 'The most holy and devout Bishop Flavian thought and spoke in harmony with the teaching of Cyril as contained in the letters of the most sacred Cyril that have been read.'

295. Nestorius the most devout bishop of Phlagonis said: 'Flavian of blessed memory taught consistently with what has been read from the faithful minutes and from the teaching of Cyril of blessed memory.'¹⁹⁷

296. Macarius the most devout bishop of Cabasa said: 'I too say the same, for the most sacred Bishop Flavian gave a fine exposition that is consistent with the faith of the holy Cyril.'

297. Constantine the most devout bishop of Demetrias in Thessaly said: 'My metropolitan is sick and therefore still at Helenopolis.'¹⁹⁸ As for me, I

195 Hellas is an alternative name for the province of Achaea in southern Greece.

196 Athanasius and the three bishops who spoke after him were the four Egyptian bishops who came over to the side of the government, supporting Pope Leo against Dioscorus, and who returned to Alexandria after the council to elect Proterius as Dioscorus' successor; see Liberatus, *Breviarium* 14, *ACO* 2.5 p. 123.

197 Bishop Nestorius' desertion of Dioscorus may be accounted for by the fact that, according to the deacon Ischyrius (III. 50), he had suffered at the hands of Dioscorus. After Proterius' murder he was the first signatory of a letter of protest to the emperor Leo from pro-Chalcedonian clergy in Egypt (*ACO* 2.5 pp. 11–17); he fled to Constantinople, where in 458 he and other Egyptian clerics received Leo, *ep.* 160 (*ACO* 2.4 pp. 107–8, *ep.* 100).

198 Vigilantius must have fallen ill on the journey from Nicaea. But his appearance in the attendance lists from 20 October (Session on Photius and Eustathius 2.50) may be accepted as evidence (despite the unreliability of these lists) that he recovered and arrived at Chalcedon in the middle of the council.

share the faith of the 318 and agree with the statements of the blessed Cyril that have just been read, and may I be anathema if I believe or ever believed otherwise. I agree with them, just as Flavian of blessed memory agreed with the statements of the blessed Cyril.'

298. Euty chius the most devout bishop of Hadrianopolis in Epirus Vetus, Claudius the most devout bishop of Anchiasmus, Mark the most devout bishop of Euroea, Peregrinus the most devout bishop of Phoenice, and Soterichus the most devout bishop of Corcyra said: 'Our most holy father Atticus bishop of the metropolis of Nicopolis left a short time ago when he felt extremely unwell.¹⁹⁹ As for ourselves, we testify that the blessed Flavian spoke in harmony with the letters that have been read of our father the blessed Cyril, [now] among the saints, and we ask that all the rest of the proceedings be read.'

And they all crossed over to the other side.

299. Dioscorus the most devout bishop of Alexandria said: 'Clearly Flavian was deposed for this reason, that he spoke of two natures after the union. But I have quotations from the holy fathers Athanasius, Gregory and Cyril saying in numerous passages that one should not speak of two natures after the union but of one incarnate nature of the Word. I am being cast out together with the fathers. I stand by the doctrines of the fathers, and do not transgress in any respect. And I have these quotations not indiscriminately or in a haphazard form but in books. As all have asked, I too request that the rest be read.'

300. The most glorious officials and the exalted senate said: 'Let the sequel be read.'

Veronicianus the hallowed secretary of the divine consistory read from the same document:

(Constantinople)

301. The most God-beloved Bishop Basil of the metropolis of Seleucia said: 'Who can criticize the statements of our blessed father Cyril? Through his own wisdom he checked the impiety of Nestorius when it was about to engulf the world; and when the latter was dividing into two persons and two sons the one Christ, our Lord, God and Saviour, he proved that one must acknowledge perfect Godhead

and perfect manhood in a single person, Son, Lord, and Master of the creation. We therefore accept all his writings and letters as true and full of piety, and we worship the one Jesus Christ our Lord, acknowledged in two natures. As "the reflection of the Father's glory",²⁰⁰ he possessed one of these in himself eternally, while, as born from a mother for our sake, he took the other nature from her and united it to himself hypostatically, and so is called the perfect God and Son of God and also perfect man and son of man, wishing to save us all through becoming similar to us in all things except sin.²⁰¹ We affirm that those who are opposed to these doctrines are enemies of the church.'

302. The most God-beloved Bishop Seleucus of the metropolis of Amaseia said: 'Our hearts are filled with joy by the doctrines of the holy father, and at that time bishop, Cyril that have just been read, by the wisdom of the most holy Archbishop Flavian, and now by the assent of the most holy Bishop Basil. Since these doctrines are apostolic, orthodox and pious, I too agree and concur with them; whoever holds contrary opinions I anathematize and deem to have no part in the ecclesiastical and orthodox unity. For we too believe in the one Jesus Christ our Lord, the Word from God, light from light, life from life, to be defined in two natures after the incarnation and the assumption of the flesh from holy Mary. We proclaim that whoever holds contrary opinion has no part in the church.'

(Ephesus II)

303. The holy synod said: 'No one says the Lord is two after the union. He was not bishop of Amaseia. Do not divide the indivisible. This is what Nestorius held. He was not bishop of Amaseia. He was not from Amaseia, but is from Sinope.'²⁰²

304. Dioscorus bishop of Alexandria said: 'Briefly be silent, and let us hear other blasphemies. Why do we blame Nestorius alone? There are many Nestoriuses.'

²⁰⁰ Heb. 1:3.

²⁰¹ An echo of Heb. 4:15, 'tempted in all things in likeness [to us] without sin'. It is notable that both this citation and 'acknowledged in two natures' were included in the Chalcedonian Definition (V. 34).

²⁰² i.e., a Cynic, a follower of Diogenes of Sinope. For other interpretations see Hefele-Leclerq, II.1, 595.

¹⁹⁹ Atticus had been a keen supporter of Dioscorus and Eutyches (884.26) and made a significant pro-Alexandrian intervention at the second session (II. 29). His sudden and temporary illness at this point (he had been present at the beginning of the session, 3.47) was doubtless diplomatic.

305. John presbyter and protonotary said: 'Let us note from what has been read that those who speak in this way expound a different creed from that issued at Nicaea and confirmed at the earlier council here.'

306. Olympius bishop of Augaza said: 'If the creed takes its origin from the minutes, let those who provided that origin be anathema.'

(Constantinople)

307. The most God-beloved Bishop Saturninus of the metropolis of Marcianopolis said: 'If anyone holds a belief contrary to what has just been read at this holy synod, let him, according to the decrees of these holy fathers, have no part in our communion, as one who does not abide by the excellent decrees of the holy fathers.'

308. The most God-beloved Bishop Aetherichus of the city of Smyrna said: 'I too agree and concur as do the fathers here present, both previously, now, in the future, and in the age to come.'

(Ephesus II)

309. Aetherichus bishop of Smyrna said: 'I didn't say that.'

310. Dioscorus bishop of Alexandria said: 'What is he saying?'

311. John presbyter and protonotary said: 'He alleges falsification.'

312. Dioscorus bishop of Alexandria said: 'Let the most devout Bishop Aetherichus explain what he means.'

313. Aetherichus bishop of Smyrna said: 'I arrived post-haste at Constantinople, and joined the hearers,²⁰³ and then [heard] this very same monk together with them. He²⁰⁴ said: "Sir, sign here." I said: "Let us for the time being simply look on, for we have heard certain statements of his." He then said: "Expound the faith." I said: "I am not able to do so. I certainly know it, but I cannot express it, except to say: If anyone holds different beliefs from the 318 and those at Ephesus, let him be anathema both now and in the age to come."²⁰⁵

314. Dioscorus bishop of Alexandria said: 'Has what has been read been falsified?'

203 The word 'hearer' (ἀκροατής) could be used to mean the member of a council (*PGL* 65 cites only this passage, but cf. 1028 below). But Aetherichus is using the word tendentiously, to suggest that he and other bishops present were mere spectators and could not be held responsible for what happened.

204 Flavian is meant. Aetherichus' inarticulateness doubtless reflects his perturbation.

205 As at 323 below, Aetherichus is referring to the statement he appended to his signature to Eutyches' condemnation; see 552.8 for the exact wording.

315. Aetherichus bishop of Smyrna said: 'I don't know.'

316. Dioscorus bishop of Alexandria said: 'Have you nothing more to say?'

317. Aetherichus bishop of Smyrna said: 'No.'

318. Dioscorus bishop of Alexandria said: 'Have you heard what you are supposed to have said?'

319. Aetherichus bishop of Smyrna said: 'I have.'

320. Dioscorus bishop of Alexandria said: 'And you didn't say it?'

321. Aetherichus bishop of Smyrna said: 'No.'

322. Dioscorus bishop of Alexandria said: 'This man's testimony is plain. Let the sequel be read.'

(Chalcedon)

323. During the reading Aetherichus the most devout bishop of Smyrna stood up and said: 'Originally I simply agreed and signed. I went off [to Ephesus]. Dioscorus the most devout bishop suddenly collared me and said, "Why did you sign Eutyches' condemnation?" I replied, "I signed along with all our fathers. If there is anything else, tell me." He said, "Why did you sign?" I said, "I signed what they brought to me: 'Anathema to whoever does not believe with the 318 and as did those at Ephesus; let him be anathema.' What they wrote after that I don't know." I said this in front of everyone.'

324. Dioscorus the most devout bishop of Alexandria said: 'Let him produce two witnesses.'

325. Aetherichus the most devout bishop of Smyrna said: 'I share the beliefs of Cyril.'

326. The most glorious officials and the exalted senate said: 'In whose presence did Dioscorus the most devout bishop make these remarks to you?'

327. Aetherichus the most devout bishop of Smyrna said: 'In front of everyone.'

328. Thalassius the most devout bishop of Caesarea said: 'What was written down, you spoke without compulsion. Why do you now want to cancel it?'

329. Dioscorus the most devout bishop of Alexandria said: 'Is he not going to be punished for his calumny? If I was condemned, would I not be punished?'

Veronicianus the hallowed secretary of the divine consistory read from the same document:

(Constantinople)

330.²⁰⁶ The most devout Bishop Valerian²⁰⁷ said: 'I confess two births, from the divine [nature] and from the flesh, the divine being from the Father and the flesh from the mother, but one and the same Son of God, as all the fathers have defined; there are two births in one person. My confession accords with the decrees of the 318 fathers who convened at Nicaea and of the holy council at Ephesus and with the definitions of Cyril of blessed memory, bishop of the metropolis of Alexandria; this is my confession and belief.'

331. The most God-beloved Bishop Longinus of the city of Chersonesus said: 'Also following the holy and great council of the 318 that convened at Nicaea, our father Bishop Cyril, [now] among the saints, expounded the doctrine in his letter²⁰⁸ with complete accuracy. So I too repeat the assent of the most God-beloved Archbishop Flavian and the most God-beloved bishops, acknowledging that after the incarnation we worship the Godhead from two natures of the only-begotten Son of God and our Saviour Jesus Christ. Those who oppose this creed we deem to have no part in the most pious faith of the holy church.'

(Chalcedon)

332. During the reading Dioscorus the most devout bishop of Alexandria said: 'I accept "from two [natures]"; I do not accept "two". I am compelled to speak brashly: my soul is at stake.'²⁰⁹

333. Eusebius the most devout bishop of Dorylaeum said: 'You have already been my death.'²¹⁰

334. Dioscorus the most devout bishop of Alexandria said: 'I shall

206 The Greek version begins, 'Of this speech in Latin the Greek translation is as follows' – reflecting a stage in the transmission of the text when the original Latin of Valerian's intervention and a Greek translation were both included.

207 Probably the Bishop Valerian of Bassianae (Pannonia) who attended Chalcedon (III. 2.11) and was presumably a refugee resident in Constantinople.

208 In view of the reference to 'two natures' in the following sentence the reference (if at all precise) must be to Cyril's Letter to John of Antioch, read out above (246).

209 This intervention turned out to be fatal, since Dioscorus' espousal of 'from two natures' was used by the chairman in the fifth session as a ground for insisting on the removal of the expression from the draft definition of the faith and its replacement by a stronger dyophysite formula (V. 26).

210 Eusebius was deposed at Ephesus II and imprisoned, though he managed to escape to Rome.

defend myself before God both here and there.'²¹¹

335. Eusebius the most devout bishop of Dorylaeum said: 'And before the laws, do you mean? Why did I come here? Entirely to demand justice from you. Surely you didn't come here just to greet us?'

336.²¹² Paschasinus the most devout bishop said: 'Was Bishop Flavian, when this man was conducting the hearing, allowed to say as much as *he* is now doing?'²¹³

337. The most glorious officials and the exalted senate said: 'But now the council is proceeding in accordance with justice.'

338. Lucentius the most devout bishop, representing the apostolic see, said: 'The council is just. Let both parties enjoy the right to speak.'

Veronicianus the hallowed secretary of the divine consistory read from the same document:

(Constantinople)

339. The most God-beloved Bishop Meliphthongus of Juliopolis said: 'According to the divine apostle,²¹⁴ even if an angel from heaven were to proclaim to us something different from what has just been read from the holy fathers of the councils at Nicaea and at Ephesus, let him be anathema. And may they be anathema who do not acknowledge two natures brought together in true unity into one and the same Son of God, true God from true God, Jesus Christ. Those who introduce any innovation contrary to the teaching of the holy apostles and fathers and who unsettle the church of God will undergo judgement, whoever they may be.'²¹⁵

340. The most God-beloved Bishop Julian of Cos said: 'No one of sound convictions can oppose the faith defined by the holy fathers at Nicaea and again by the holy and great council that convened in the metropolis of Ephesus. We accordingly acknowledge two natures in one person, and therefore one Son, one Lord Jesus Christ. And if anyone carried away by satanic madness and following his own reasoning, as he supposes, holds an opinion that differs from that which we have received from the holy fathers who preceded us, let him have no part in the church.'

211 That is, both at this council and at the Last Judgement.

212 The Greek version begins, 'Of the Latin the Greek translation is as follows'. Cf. n. 206.

213 Flavian had no adequate opportunity to defend himself at Ephesus (868–71).

214 Cf. Gal. 1:6.

215 Cf. Gal. 5:10.

(*Chalcedon*)

341. During the reading Dioscorus the most devout bishop of Alexandria said: 'Mark, this is what I object to: there are not two natures after the union.'

Veronicianus the hallowed secretary of the divine consistory read from the same document:

(*Constantinople*)

342. The most God-beloved Bishop Sabas of the city of Paltus said: 'We have learnt to follow the fathers. For our fathers at Nicaea did not speak what they spoke on their own account, but according to the prompting of the Holy Spirit. Likewise the most God-beloved and sacred blessed Cyril uttered and expressed the faith of the fathers through the inspiration of the Holy Spirit. He was followed by the primate of the Orient, the most God-beloved John bishop of Antioch;²¹⁶ he was also followed by the one who was the first to speak, the most God-beloved bishop Basil. This I too hold and profess; and if anyone in the whole world does not hold this faith, he has no part not only with me but with all orthodox believers. I entreat your sacredness to send this document to the Orient and so protect us from calumny; if anyone does not subscribe to the document, he should have no part with us.'

343. The most God-beloved Bishop Thomas of Valentinianopolis said: 'Since the doctrines of piety defined by the holy councils that met at Nicaea and in the metropolis of Ephesus are with profit to the soul, we have believed and teach the same to the congregations in our care, and decree that those who do not hold them have no part in the orthodox church.'

344. The most God-beloved Bishop Trypho of the city of Chios in the Islands said: 'We have believed and believe in accordance with the teaching of the holy fathers at Nicaea and the blessed Archbishop Cyril, [now] among the saints. Those who do not believe the doctrines of the fathers we anathematize and judge to have no part in the holy church.'

216 The Formula of Reunion, an Antiochene formulation accepted by Cyril (see 246 with our notes *ad loc.*), is here treated as if it were a Cyrillian formula that the Antiochenes had approved. Though strictly inaccurate, this view was widely held and greatly assisted the acceptance at Chalcedon of a definition heavily indebted to the Formula.

345. The most God-beloved Bishop Timothy of the city of Primupolis said: 'Our father Cyril of blessed memory, then bishop of Alexandria, followed the pious and orthodox definitions of the holy fathers at Nicaea and transmitted God-beloved doctrines to us. To them we give our agreement and assent. Whoever does not follow them should have no part in the holy church of God.'

346. The most God-beloved Bishop Eudoxius of Bosporus said: 'Our father the thrice-blessed Cyril, following the great and holy council at Nicaea make clear to us, concerning the coming of Christ our Saviour, that God before the ages, the Son of the Father, became man in the last days, in order to cancel the bond that stood against us,²¹⁷ and assumed a perfect man for our salvation. Whoever does not agree with the teaching of the holy fathers deprives himself of any part in the priestly communion and the coming of Christ.'

(*Chalcedon*)

347. During the reading Eustathius the most devout bishop of Berytus said: 'He did not assume a man but became man; flesh is what he assumed.'²¹⁸

Veronicianus the hallowed secretary of the divine consistory read from the same document:

(*Constantinople*)

348. The most God-beloved Bishop Eustochius of the city of Docimium said: 'We have found that the teaching of the holy fathers of the holy council at Nicaea, the letters of the most sacred and God-beloved Bishop Cyril that have been read to us, and the canons and creed issued by the holy and great council at Ephesus, are in total harmony with each other. I therefore believe and profess the same, and judge whoever holds different opinions to have no part in the holy catholic church and the orthodox faith.'

349. The most God-beloved Bishop Julian of the city of Mostene said: 'Since the canonical texts issued by the blessed Cyril, [now] among the saints, and by the most holy councils at Nicaea and at Ephesus that have been read to us are clear and edifying, I hold and believe the same. Whoever holds contrary opinions should have no part in the holy church and the orthodox faith.'

217 Col. 2:14.

218 Eudoxius' language of Christ assuming a perfect man is Antiochene in flavour and would not satisfy a strict Cyrillian such as Eustathius.

350. The most God-beloved Bishop Cossinius of the city of Hierocaesarea said: 'Having heard the letters of our sacred fathers that have been read and the proceedings in the metropolis of Ephesus, which accord with the holy canons issued in the city of Nicaea, we hold and believe and teach the same to the congregation in our charge. Whoever holds a different opinion should have no part in the holy catholic church.'

351. The most God-beloved Bishop John of the city of Hyrcanis said: 'I give my agreement and approval to what has just been read, which was formerly issued by the holy fathers at Nicaea and preached in an orthodox fashion by the sacred bishops. Strengthened, like all the holy fathers, by the grace of Christ, I reject as insane those who hold a different opinion and judge them to have no part in the orthodox faith.'

352. The most God-beloved Bishop Eusebius said: 'Since some of the most God-beloved bishops staying in this imperial city have not come together, whether through illness or unawareness of the summons from the holy council, I request that the absentees be asked by the most devout presbyter and notary Asterius and the most devout deacons and notaries to read the proceedings and make clear their own opinion.'

353. The most holy archbishop said: 'The most devout notaries shall speak to the absentees from among the most God-beloved bishops and read them the proceedings so that each can register his own opinion.'

(Constantinople 448, Third Session)

354. Under the chairmanship of our most holy and sacred Archbishop Flavian the holy synod sat again with him in the episcopal consistory, on Monday 15 November in the consulship recorded above.

355. The most God-beloved Bishop Eusebius said: 'Today is now the fourth day since I appeared before your holiness to demand the appearance at your holy synod of Eutyches, presbyter and archimandrite, who is due to be proved guilty by me of having corrupted the doctrines of orthodoxy and holding views that differ from the beliefs of the catholic church. I request that those who were sent at that time by your holiness should be asked to say what reply they got from him.'

356. The most holy archbishop said: 'Let the notaries say who it is that have already been sent.'

357. The notaries said: 'A short while ago your holiness ordered the most religious presbyter and advocate John, and the most devout deacon Andrew, to visit the most devout presbyter and archimandrite Eutyches. They are both present.'

358. The most holy archbishop said: 'Let them present themselves at the holy synod, and let the most devout presbyter and advocate John say first if he went to deliver a summons to the presbyter and archimandrite Eutyches, whether he met him, and what reply he got.'

359. The most devout presbyter and advocate John said: 'A short time ago the most God-beloved Bishop Eusebius appeared at the assembly before your holiness and brought an accusation against the most devout presbyter and archimandrite Eutyches; he presented a written document declaring that he is riddled with heresy, and demanded that he be summoned before your holiness to defend himself against the charges he brought against him. Taking thought, your unerring wisdom gave orders that the most devout deacon Andrew and I should go to see him in his monastery²¹⁹ and summon him to make his defence. This we did: we visited him in his monastery, read him the indictment, gave him copies, disclosed the accuser, and communicated to him the summons to come and defend himself before your holiness. He, however, utterly refused to appear and defend himself, asserting that a rule had been previously laid down by him, and had bound him with a regulation from the very beginning, that he was never to leave his community to go anywhere at all, but was in a way to live in the monastery as if in a tomb. He asked us to tell your holiness that the most God-beloved Bishop Eusebius has long been his enemy and has brought this accusation against him simply in order to slander and insult him. He said that he is ready to assent to the expositions of the holy fathers who held a council at Nicaea and at Ephesus, and promised to subscribe to their interpretations, while if there happened to be some mistake or error on their part in certain expressions, this he would neither criticize nor embrace, but examine only the scriptures as being more reliable than the exposition of the fathers. He said that after the incarnation of God the Word, that is, after the birth of our Lord Jesus Christ, he worships one nature, that of God enfleshed and made man; he produced and read a tract to this

²¹⁹ Probably the monastery of St Job at Hebdomon, a western suburb of Constantinople; see Honigmann 1950, 230.

effect, adding in regard to a calumny (as he said) uttered against him, to the effect that he had said that God the Word had brought his flesh down from heaven, that of such a calumny he is wholly innocent. As for the assertion that our Lord Jesus Christ had come into being from two natures united hypostatically, he said that he had neither learnt it in the expositions of the holy fathers nor, if such a statement were read to him by someone, would he accept it, since the divine scriptures, as he claimed, are better than the teaching of the fathers. While asserting this, he acknowledged as perfect God and perfect man the one who was born from the Virgin Mary but does not have flesh consubstantial with us. This is what he said in conversation with me.²²⁰

360. The most holy archbishop said: 'Were you the only person to hear this, or did the deacon Andrew who was sent with you also hear it?'

361. The most devout presbyter and advocate John said: 'When I was being told to convey these statements to your sacredness, the most devout deacon Andrew was also present.'

362. The most holy archbishop said: 'Let the most devout deacon Andrew say if he heard these things being said by the most devout presbyter and archimandrite Eutyches.'

363. The most devout deacon Andrew said: 'In accordance with the order of your holiness we went to the most devout presbyter and archimandrite Eutyches, and while conversing with him we heard him make the statements that the most devout presbyter and advocate John has already borne witness to.'

364. The most devout presbyter and advocate John said: 'At the time of our discussion with the most devout presbyter and archimandrite Eutyches, when he was telling us to convey these statements to your holiness, the most devout deacon of the most God-beloved Bishop Basil was also present there and heard what was said. I therefore request that he be summoned and asked what of this he heard.'

365. The most holy archbishop said: 'Let the most devout notaries say if the deacon assisting the most God-beloved Bishop Basil who

220 This text should be carefully compared to John's original aide-memoire (648) on which it is based and which was read at a public hearing in the following year. The published version is basically accurate, but makes Eutyches' reservations about the authority of the fathers more sharply expressed than they originally were. His alleged statement that the flesh of Christ is not consubstantial with us is not to be found in the original (a point made by Eutyches' representative at 652), but for his reservations over this tenet see 516.

has been mentioned by the most devout presbyter and advocate John is here present.'

366. The notaries said: 'The assistant of the most God-beloved Bishop Basil, who is seated with your holiness, is present here.'

367. The most holy archbishop said: 'Let him stand in the centre.'

368. After he had done so, the most holy archbishop said: 'What is your name?'

369. He said: 'Athanasius.'

370. The most holy archbishop said: 'What is your ecclesiastical rank?'

371. Athanasius said: 'I am a deacon.'

372. The most holy archbishop said: 'Of what city?'

373. Deacon Athanasius said: 'The Seleucia that is under the most holy Bishop Basil.'

374. The most holy archbishop said: 'Tell us what you heard the most devout presbyter and archimandrite Eutyches say about the faith in the presence of the most devout presbyter and advocate John and the deacon Andrew.'

375. Deacon Athanasius said: 'What I heard is what the most God-beloved presbyter and advocate John and the most devout deacon Andrew have testified.'

376. The most God-beloved Bishop Eusebius said: 'The declarations of the most devout presbyter and advocate John and the most devout deacon Andrew and the testimony of Athanasius the most devout deacon of the holy church of Seleucia are sufficient to prove that he holds impious opinions that are contrary to the teaching of the holy fathers. Nevertheless I ask your holiness to send him a second summons, since I have many witnesses to prove the error of the views that he has held, holds, and teaches.'

377. The most holy archbishop said: 'Let him appear, acknowledge his errors, and come to repentance, since our Lord Jesus Christ rejoices over the salvation of the lost, and is the first to go about in search of the sheep that has gone astray.²²¹ This is why the most devout presbyters Mamas and Theophilus have again been sent to give him a warning and present him with the summons sent him by us to appear before the holy synod which has been scandalized not only by the indictment brought against him by Eusebius the most God-beloved bishop but also by the testimony as to his heresy and obduracy

221 Cf. Mt. 18:12.

presented by John the most religious presbyter and advocate and by Andrew and Athanasius the most devout deacons. Perhaps he will come and purge his former impiety, recognize the orthodox faith and the teaching of our holy fathers, and so receive the pardon we are bound to bestow on those who intend repentance.'

378. The most God-beloved Bishop Eusebius said: 'May your holiness deign to give orders that there first be read the summons composed by the holy synod, so that it too may be included in the minutes.'

379. The most holy archbishop said: 'Let it be read and inserted in the guarantee of the minutes.'

380. *The holy and great home synod meeting by the grace of God in Christ-loving and imperial Constantinople Rome to the most devout presbyter and archimandrite Eutyches.*

By this second summons we now summon you through the most devout presbyters Mamas and Theophilus to come immediately and defend yourself before the holy synod against the charges brought by the most God-beloved Bishop Eusebius that you have held, hold, and communicate to others tenets contrary to the faith. Come therefore without delay to the meeting, lest refusing to be examined in person you incur the penalties laid down by the divine canons. Your excuse that you have resolved not to leave the monastery is not convincing when you are faced with such serious charges.

381. While the holy synod was still in session and awaiting Mamas and Theophilus, the most devout presbyters, who had been sent to summon Eutyches the most devout presbyter and archimandrite, and the exposition of the faith by the holy fathers was being read, the most God-beloved Bishop Eusebius took his stand in the centre and said: 'A man who has blasphemed against God and held opinions contrary to the orthodox faith will have the impudence to rush into anything. I have learnt that Eutyches the presbyter and archimandrite has sent a tract to the monasteries and is inciting the monks to revolt. Since the security of the church and of the holy synod requires an investigation into this and a discovery of what he is now plotting and contriving as he stirs up sedition, I request that the presbyter of the martyrion at Hebdomon, who is here, be asked if he sent a tract and collected signatures.'

382. The most holy archbishop said: 'Is the person about whom you have testified here present?'

383. The notaries said: 'He is present.'

384. The most holy archbishop said: 'Let him stand in the centre.'

385. When he had done so, the most holy archbishop said: 'What is your name?'

386. He said: 'Abramius.'

387. The most holy archbishop said: 'With what rank are you honoured?'

388. Abramius said: 'I am a presbyter in Hebdomon, under your sacredness.'

389. The most holy archbishop said: 'Have you heard the testimony of the most religious Bishop Eusebius?'

390. Abramius said: 'Yes, by your feet.'²²²

391. The most holy archbishop said: 'What do you have to say?'

392. Abramius the presbyter said: 'Manuel the presbyter and archimandrite sent me to the presbyter Asterius to tell him that Eutyches, presbyter and archimandrite, had sent him a tract about the faith and pressed him to sign it. And this he revealed so that the presbyter Asterius would report the matter to your sacredness.'

393. The most God-beloved Bishop Eusebius said: 'Since he would not have restricted his impudence to the monastery of Manuel the presbyter, I request that we send to the other monasteries and find out whether or not he sent his tract for signing there as well in order to destroy the faith.'

394. The most holy archbishop said: 'In accordance with the request of the most God-beloved Bishop Eusebius, there will go to the monasteries – to those in the city the most devout presbyter Peter and the most devout deacon Patricius, to those on the other side in Sycae²²³ the presbyter Rhetorius and the deacon Eutropius, to those in Chalcedon the presbyters Paul and John, to discover from them if a tract was sent to them by the presbyter and archimandrite Eutyches pressing or prompting them to sign.'

395. While this was being said by the most holy archbishop, Aetius, deacon and notary, said: 'The most devout presbyters Mamas and Theophilus, who were sent today by your holiness to the most devout

²²² The full version of this formula would be 'by your feet to which I make obeisance'.

²²³ Across the Golden Horn in Sycae (Galata).

presbyter and archimandrite Eutyches, have arrived.'

396. The most holy archbishop said: 'Let the most devout presbyters who have carried out the instructions of the holy synod say what they heard from the most devout presbyter and archimandrite Eutyches and if he is ready to appear at the session of this holy synod.'

397. The most devout presbyter Mamas said: 'We went to the monastery of the most devout presbyter and archimandrite Eutyches and found some monks standing by the gate, and we went with them inside the monastery. We said to them, "Announce us: we have been sent by the most holy archbishop and the present holy synod and have to see the archimandrite." They said to us, "The lord archimandrite is unwell and unable to see you. So tell us what is it you want or why you have been sent." We didn't accept this, but said to them, "We have been sent to see him in person. We are fulfilling a written commission, and we have in our hands a letter written to him by the holy synod." They went in and returned with a monk, Eleusinius, and said, "Since our archimandrite is unwell, he has sent him in his place for you to give your message to him." Even so we didn't choose to speak with him, but said, "We have been sent by the most holy and sacred archbishop and the holy and great synod; tell us if he will receive us." When we saw that they were worried, were muttering among themselves, and were saying something, while we were getting no reply since they were worried by our having a written commission, we said to them, "What are you worried about? There is nothing burdensome. The letter is not secret, but we can tell you the purport of the letter: the holy synod orders him now for the second time to appear and to take his stand and defend himself against the charges brought by the most God-beloved Bishop Eusebius." Then they went inside and announced us, and the aforesaid most devout presbyter and archimandrite Eutyches received us. We went in and gave him the document that had been sent; he had it read in our presence. After the reading he said, "I have set myself a rule not to leave this monastery until forced by death. The holy synod and the most devout archbishop are aware that I am old and infirm." We said, "Agree to come and answer the charges against you before the holy synod." He said, "I will not leave my monastery, because I am held back by my resolution. If the most God-beloved archbishop and the synod wish to do something, they will do what they like. I only ask one thing, that no one takes the trouble to come for me again: I have resolved not to go out. Lest they

intend to send again, let them do what they like before summoning me a third time: it is to me as if they had summoned me already." This is what he asked us to say to my lord's holiness.²²⁴ He pressed us to take a document he had written, but we refused to accept it, saying, "If you want something, make an appearance and say what it is." While we were saying this, the document was produced and he wanted to have it read to us; even so we refused to hear it. Nevertheless he took and signed it. As we took our leave and went out, he said, "I will send this document to the holy synod together with my signature."

398. The most holy archbishop said: 'Let the most devout presbyter Theophilus tell us what he heard when he went to see the most devout presbyter and archimandrite Eutyches together with the most devout presbyter Mamas.'

399. The most devout presbyter Theophilus said: 'When I accompanied the most devout presbyter Mamas to where is the monastery of Eutyches the presbyter and archimandrite, I heard him say, "Other than death, nothing will get me outside the monastery, since that is my resolve and I cannot leave." Everything else that was said by the most devout presbyter Eutyches has been reported by the most devout presbyter Mamas just as I too heard it.'

400. The most God-beloved Bishop Eusebius said: 'Guilty people always have pretexts and excuses for causing delays. In cases of prosecution it is not proper to refuse to appear or restrict oneself to a place. What I demand is this: let the authority of the holy canons be now invoked against the accused, and order him to come here even against his will.'

401. The most holy archbishop said: 'Now that the holy synod has heard the declarations of the most devout presbyter and archimandrite Eutyches from the most devout presbyters who were sent, let it declare what it sees fit.'

402. The holy synod said: 'It is right that the most devout presbyter and monk Eutyches be told a third time by this holy and great synod to appear before this holy synod. If he does not do so, he has himself to blame.'

²²⁴ In urging the synod to condemn him without sending the canonical third summons, Eutyches was setting an obvious trap, into which the synod did not fall. But Flavian did expose himself to criticism by proceeding immediately to draw up a sentence of condemnation and showing the document to an imperial official (see 838 below).

403. The most holy archbishop said: 'Let the most devout presbyters Memnon the sacristan and Epiphanius and also Germanus the deacon go to the most devout presbyter and archimandrite Eutyches and present him with the third summons from the holy synod to appear and answer the charges.'

The missive sent with them ran as follows:

404. *The holy and great home synod meeting by the grace of God in Christ-loving and imperial Constantinople Rome to the most devout presbyter and archimandrite Eutyches.*

You are doubtless not unacquainted with what the divine canons stipulate about the obdurate who refuse to appear to defend themselves when they receive a third summons.²²⁵ To avoid incurring their most pious stipulations, now that you have received our third summons from the most devout presbyters Memnon the sacristan and Epiphanius and the most devout deacon Germanus, please present yourself tomorrow morning, that is, on Wednesday 17 November.²²⁶

(Constantinople 448, Fourth Session)

405. On the following day, Tuesday 16 November, while the most holy archbishop was presiding over the holy synod and the same most holy archbishop was discoursing on the divine doctrines, Asclepiades, deacon and notary, made an announcement: 'Some monks from among those of the presbyter and archimandrite Eutyches and also Abramius, the most devout presbyter and archimandrite, are outside and ask to come in.'

406. The most holy archbishop said: 'Let them enter.'

407. When Abramius the most devout presbyter and archimandrite entered, together with Eleusinius, Constantine and Constantius, deacons of the monastery of the most devout presbyter and archimandrite Eutyches, the most holy archbishop said: 'Why has your devoutness taken the trouble to come to us?'

408. Abramius the most devout presbyter and archimandrite said: 'We were sent.'

²²⁵ Such a refusal was taken as an admission of guilt; see vol. 2, 31–2.

²²⁶ The summons, approved at the session of 15 November, is dated to the following day, 16 November, when it would be delivered, requiring Eutyches to appear on the third day, 17 November, when the fifth session of the synod was held (420–44).

409. The most holy archbishop said: 'Who sent you?'

410. The most devout presbyter and archimandrite Abramius said: 'The archimandrite.'

411. The most holy archbishop said: 'Which archimandrite?'

412. Abramius the most devout presbyter and archimandrite said: 'Eutyches.'

413. The most holy archbishop said: 'Why in particular?'

414. Abramius the most devout presbyter and archimandrite said: 'He sent me because he is unwell. By your prayers, he was awake the whole night moaning, and his moans kept me awake. For this reason he sent for me at nightfall, and gave me a message for my lord.'

415. The most holy archbishop said: 'We yield and do not press the matter. For it is for God to give him health, and for us to await his recovery. We do not look to amputation but to growth, for "God does not delight in the death of the living."²²⁷ We are not children of misanthropy but of the philanthropy of God. If the one who was rich became poor for our sakes,²²⁸ we too must imitate his sublime poverty; for we were made by God for works of philanthropy.'

416. The most devout presbyter and archimandrite Abramius said: 'He gave me, by your feet, some other instructions, which, if questioned, I shall relate.'

417. The most holy archbishop said: 'How is it possible, I ask you, when one person is accused for another to speak on his behalf? But we prefer to yield and not press the matter. Let him come here: he will come to fathers and brothers, to people who are not ignorant of him and who even now persevere in friendship. Many have heard him and been led into error; his accuser is pressing his case, and he must defend himself. If when Nestorius was opposing the truth he put in an appearance to defend the truth,²²⁹ how much more should he now put in an appearance to defend both the truth and himself! We are human beings, and many of the great have been led into error and deceived through imprudence and inexperience even though they thought their opinions to be correct. It is not repentance that brings shame: what brings disgrace is persisting in the wrong. For just as the worm

²²⁷ Wisd. 1:13.

²²⁸ 2 Cor. 8:9.

²²⁹ Eutyches had been a member of a monastic delegation that lobbied Theodosius II during the Nestorian controversy (Kidd 1922, III, 285).

consumes the wood it comes from, so does wrongdoing when it abides in the malefactor. But let him come here, and when he confesses and anathematizes his error, we will pardon him for the past.²³⁰ As for the future, let him assure us and the holy synod that he agrees with the definitions of our holy fathers and that in future he will neither teach nor expound in the presence of others what is contrary to them. This, I urge you, is what is needed. For before you knew him I knew him, and before he knew you he knew me.'

418. Abramius the presbyter and archimandrite said: 'That is so, by your feet.'

419. When the holy synod rose, the most holy archbishop said: 'You know the zeal of the accuser; even fire seems cold to him because of his zeal for religion. God knows how I urged and begged him not to: "I beg you, drop the matter." But when he insisted, what could I do? Is my present desire to cause divisions among you? God forbid! Is it not rather to reconcile you? It is enemies who divide, and fathers who unite.'

(Constantinople 448, Fifth Session)

420. On the following day, 17 November, the holy synod met again in the episcopal consistory.

Aetius, deacon and notary, said: 'The most devout priests Memnon the sacristan and Epiphanius and the deacon Germanus, who were sent yesterday, which was 16 November, to deliver the third summons to the most devout presbyter and archimandrite Eutyches, are now present and wish to report what they heard from the person mentioned when they delivered your letter.'

421. The most holy archbishop said: 'Let Memnon the most devout presbyter speak first, and say what response he received from the most devout presbyter and archimandrite Eutyches to the missive that was sent by the holy synod.'

422. The most devout presbyter and sacristan Memnon said: 'By order of your holiness and your holy synod we went to the most devout presbyter and archimandrite Eutyches and gave him the letter sent to him by your holy synod. He took and read it, and said to us, "I sent the most devout presbyter and archimandrite Abramius to our

most holy and sacred archbishop and the holy synod, so that he could assent on my behalf to all the pronouncements of the holy fathers at Nicaea and at Ephesus and all those of the blessed Cyril."

423. While he was still speaking, the most devout Bishop Eusebius said: 'Has he now come to give his assent? My accusation relates not to the future but to the past. Have I already lost my case because some people have given him a definition and said to him, "Give in to necessity: assent or sign"?''

424. The most holy archbishop said: 'No one is letting you drop your charges or letting him off defending his past.'

425. The most devout Bishop Eusebius said: 'I demand that his statement not prejudice my case. I have reliable witnesses in whose presence he taught, and inculcates, perverse doctrines and embarked on disputation. When I urged him not just once or twice but many times to hold orthodox views, he still refused. Say to people in prison, "From today stop stealing", and they will all promise to.'

426. The most holy archbishop said: 'Nothing will cause prejudice to your religiousness relating to the accusation you have brought, even if he were to promise innumerable times to subscribe to the definitions of the holy fathers. For as we have already said time and again, it is necessary that he should first be examined in regard to the charges brought against him and present his defence.'

427. While this discussion was proceeding, the most devout presbyter and sacristan Memnon added: 'He said, "It was because I am being tested by illness"²³¹ that I sent the most devout presbyter Abramius.' When I pressed him repeatedly, "You must come and appear before the holy synod and answer the charges brought against you", he replied, "I am waiting for Father Abramius. Perhaps he will persuade my lord and the holy synod." I asked, "So what? Are we going to wait here until he returns?" He said, "I ask you to entreat the lord archbishop and the holy synod to give me less than a week's grace, and on Monday, if it be God's will, I will come and defend myself before my lord and the holy synod.'"

428. The most holy archbishop said: 'Let the most devout presbyter Epiphanius say what he heard from the most devout presbyter and archimandrite Eutyches.'

²³⁰ Yet at the next session (at 426) Flavian assures Eusebius of Dorylaeum that repentance will not absolve Eutyches from his heresy in the past.

²³¹ Eutyches is urging that, since he is being 'tested' (the Greek word ἐξετάζεσθαι means 'be examined') by illness, he should not be 'tested' by the bishops.

429. The most devout presbyter Epiphanius said: 'By the order of your holiness, the most religious presbyter and sacristan Memnon and I, together with the most devout deacon Germanus, went and gave the most devout presbyter and archimandrite Eutyches the missive written to him by your holy synod. When he had read it, he said what the most religious presbyter Memnon has testified.'

430. The most holy archbishop said: 'Let the most devout deacon Germanus say what he heard.'

431. The most devout deacon Germanus said: 'By order of your holiness and the holy synod, we went to the most devout presbyter and archimandrite Eutyches, and he said what the most devout presbyters have testified.'

432. The most devout Bishop Eusebius said: 'I recently requested your holiness, because of the rebellion he is plotting, spreading dissension in the monasteries, to send to the convents to confirm that he has been stirring them all up, telling them that they have to sign some tract which was either composed by himself or came into his hands I know not how. In regard to this your holiness ordered some of the most devout clerics to go to the convents.²³² Tell them also to appear and give evidence, to be inserted in the guarantee of the minutes, of what they heard from the monks.'

433. The most holy archbishop said: 'Let some of the notaries say who it was that were sent to the monasteries in the city.'

434. The notaries said: 'The most devout men Peter the presbyter and Patricius the deacon, and they are present here.'

435. The most holy archbishop said: 'Let them tell us what they heard from each of the most devout archimandrites.'

436. The most devout presbyter Peter said: 'By order of your holiness and the holy synod we went to the monastery of the most devout presbyter and archimandrite Martin, and asked him if he had received any document from the most devout presbyter and archimandrite Eutyches. He replied that one had been sent to him on the previous Friday, which is the twelfth of November, through a certain deacon Constantine – "asking me to sign, but I refused, saying that it was not for me to sign but only for bishops. He said as he left, 'If you don't support me now, the bishop will humiliate me, and then eventually he will attack you.'" On our departure we went to the most devout

232 See 392–4 above.

presbyter and archimandrite Faustus.'

437. The most holy archbishop said: 'Did the most devout presbyter and archimandrite Martin say what was contained in the document he refused to sign?'

438. The most devout presbyter Peter said: 'He said that it was the proceedings at Ephesus.'²³³

439. The most holy archbishop said: 'When he made this reply to him, had he actually read the document and apprized its contents, or was he speaking merely from hearsay?'

440. The most devout presbyter Peter said: 'He hadn't read it but said they were the proceedings of the blessed Cyril and the bishops at Ephesus; the document had been signed, but he²³⁴ kept the signatures hidden. Likewise the most devout presbyter and archimandrite Faustus said that a document had been sent to him through Constantine and Eleusinius, saying that he ought to sign. When he asked about the purport of the document, the answer was that it was the definitions of the 318 and of the bishops who convened at Ephesus: "I said to them (he said), 'we have copies of them. Give them to me to examine, in case they contain any additions.' They refused and went on their way. We are the children of the church, and as our one father after God we have the archbishop." The lord Job said, "He didn't send us a tract, but he did say, 'In these days the archbishop has a document to send for you to sign, but don't obey him.'" We went off to Manuel, and he said that nothing had been sent to him; similarly to Abramius, and he also said that he had received neither message nor document.'

441. The most holy archbishop said: 'Let Patricius the deacon also say what he heard from the most devout presbyters and archimandrites.'

442. The most devout deacon Patricius said: 'I was sent by your holiness and your holy synod along with the most devout presbyter Peter, and what I heard is what the aforementioned most devout presbyter has testified.'

443. The most God-beloved Bishop Eusebius said: 'Your holiness sees the misdeeds committed by Eutyches the archimandrite, and that he holds opinions contrary to the faith. This has been testified by the most devout presbyter and advocate John, by the most devout deacon

233 The Acts of the First Council of Ephesus (*ACO* 1.1.2 pp. 3–64), in which Nestorius was deposed and Cyril of Alexandria's Second Letter to Nestorius formally approved.

234 Constantine the deacon, as reported by the archimandrite Martin to Peter.

Andrew who was sent along with him, and by the most devout Athanasius, Bishop Basil's deacon, and is now made known to your holiness by the most devout archimandrites through the most devout clerics who were sent to them. What ground for defence still remains to him? I therefore demand that the stipulations in the holy canons be now applied even to him. For how can one who incites tumult and holds opinions contrary to the faith have the right to be numbered among the priests of God and the archimandrites? Note too that he stands convicted of perjury. For he said, "I have resolved not to go out, and the monastery is my tomb"; but he now promises to come, hoping for a postponement and concocting other ploys, in order to escape cross-examination and avoid punishment.'

444. The most holy archbishop said: 'All the testimonies relating to Eutyches the presbyter and archimandrite suffice to prove to us that he holds opinions contrary to the orthodox faith and has tried to cause turmoil in the church, in such a way that he is in consequence already liable to the canonical penalties of deprivation of both the priestly rank he enjoys and the headship of a monastery. But for the sake of greater exactitude we grant him the respite he has asked for. For after he has appeared accordingly, he will be examined in person. But if the presbyter and archimandrite Eutyches does not appear according to his promise on the coming Monday, that is, on the twenty-second of the current month of November, he will be totally stripped of presbyteral rank and deprived of the headship of a monastery.'

(Constantinople 448, Sixth Session)

445. On Saturday 20 November the holy and great synod met in the episcopal consistory.

The most God-beloved Bishop Eusebius said: 'With regard to my written indictment of Eutyches the presbyter and archimandrite, I ask your holiness to order certain persons whom I need for the case I have brought against him to appear before your holy synod on the coming Monday, when he himself has promised to attend. Those whom I require are his assistant Narses the presbyter, his friend Maximus the archimandrite, Constantine deacon and steward of the same Eutyches, and Eleusinius deacon of the same monastery. From their presence at the hearing the truth will become clear.'

446. The most holy archbishop said: 'Let those required by the most devout Bishop Eusebius be summoned to appear on the appointed day.'

447. The most God-beloved Bishop Eusebius said: 'I have been informed by certain people that during the second summons by your holy synod the most devout presbyters you sent, Mamas and Theophilus, heard some remarks from Eutyches the presbyter and archimandrite that were not recorded in the text of the minutes, and that, if these came to light, there would be clear proof of his opinions. I therefore request that the presbyters Mamas and Theophilus be summoned to relate over the holy gospels what they heard from Eutyches the presbyter and archimandrite.'

448. The most holy archbishop said: 'Let the notaries say if the most devout presbyters who have been mentioned are present.'

449. The notaries said: 'The most devout presbyter Theophilus is present, but the most devout presbyter Mamas is not here.'

450. The most holy archbishop said: 'You have heard what was said by the most God-beloved Bishop Eusebius. Therefore, having before your eyes the fear of God, testify truthfully everything you heard the presbyter Eutyches say when you were sent to summon him by ourselves and the holy synod.'

451. The most devout presbyter Theophilus said: 'By order of your holiness the most religious presbyter Mamas and I went to the monastery of the most devout presbyter and archimandrite Eutyches and gave him the letter of summons sent to him by the holy synod. He began by wanting to dispute with us, and when the most devout presbyter Mamas said to him, "We haven't come to dispute with your devoutness but to summon you to appear before the holy synod", the same most devout presbyter and archimandrite began by saying, in the presence of the presbyter Narses, the archimandrite Maximus and some other monks, "Where in scripture does 'two natures' occur?" and then, "Who among the holy fathers taught that God the Word has two natures?" When we said to him in reply, "Then you must tell us where the *homoousion*²³⁵ occurs, or where scripture mentions it", the same most devout Eutyches replied, "It doesn't occur in scripture but in the teaching of the fathers." To this the most devout presbyter Mamas retorted, "Just as the *homoousion* doesn't occur in scripture but was taught by the fathers, so in the same way the same holy fathers taught about two natures." I myself added, "Is God the Word

²³⁵ The statement in the Nicene Creed that the Son is 'consubstantial (*ὁμοούσιον*) with the Father'.

perfect or not?" The same presbyter [Eutyches] replied, "Perfect." I said, "Is the enfleshed one perfect man or not?" The presbyter replied, "Perfect." I said, "If then [he is] perfect God and perfect man, what stops us saying that the one Son is from two natures? Two perfect elements make up one Son." To this the most devout presbyter and archimandrite Eutyches replied, "May I never say that Christ is from two natures or attempt to define the nature of my God. If they wish to depose me or want to act against me in some way, let them do it, if God so permit; for in the faith which I received, in it I stand firm and wish to die." This is what I heard from him.'

452. The most holy archbishop said: 'Tell us why, if you heard these remarks about the faith from the most devout Eutyches, you kept quiet about them when you were here on the previous occasion?'

453. The most devout presbyter Theophilus said: 'Your godliness knows that we were sent not for this purpose but simply to summon the presbyter Eutyches. So, since we were not asked, we thought it unnecessary to mention matters that lay outside our commission.'

454. The notaries said: 'The presbyter Mamas, whom the most God-beloved Bishop Eusebius mentioned, has arrived.'

455. The most holy archbishop said: 'Let the testimony of the most devout presbyter Theophilus be read to the most devout presbyter Mamas.'

456. After the reading the most devout presbyter Mamas said: 'If I was being questioned about a human being, as a cleric I could not lie. When the faith is under discussion, I will neither deny nor lie – God forbid! Since when we were sent we had no other instructions from the holy synod than simply to pass on a letter and get a reply whether he would come or not, I thought it unnecessary in my first testimony to testify what he had chosen to say. But since the most religious Bishop Eusebius has asked for testimony on what was said as well, I give the same testimony as the most devout presbyter Theophilus. When we maintained silence and refused to discuss anything with him, he obtruded his opinions on matters of dogma. We reproved him gently. He said, "God the Word enfleshed came to raise up fallen human nature." I immediately interjected, "Which [nature]?" He again said, "Human nature." I said, "Take note of this 'human nature'; now tell me by which nature it was raised." He said, "I was not taught by scripture about two natures." I said, "We were not taught about the *homoousion* by scripture either, but by the holy fathers who

understood scripture devoutly and expounded it faithfully. It was in this way that we learnt both about the *homoousion* and about Christ the Son of God being from two natures." He responded, "I do not attempt to define the nature of the Godhead, nor do I say two natures – God forbid! Here I am; if I am deposed, let the monastery be my tomb, and if it is God's will that I suffer, I shall suffer most willingly, for I do not acknowledge two natures." It is for the reason I gave – that we went not to dispute but simply to give and receive messages – that we didn't testify to this on the previous occasion.'

457. The most holy archbishop said: 'The testimony of both the most devout presbyters is clear. Therefore let it be included in the guarantee of the minutes.'

(Constantinople 448, Seventh Session)

458. The holy and great synod met again, in the presence of the holy and dread gospels, and under the chairmanship of our most holy Archbishop Flavian, in the episcopal consistory on the day appointed, Monday, 22 November.

Asterius, presbyter and notary said: 'The appointed day has come, and the most God-beloved Bishop Eusebius is standing at the door seeking to enter.'

459. The most holy archbishop said: 'Let him enter.'

460. After his entry the most holy archbishop said: 'Let the deacons Philippus and Beryllus go and look for the most devout presbyter and archimandrite Eutyches in the episcopal palace, if he has come as he promised, and summon him to the session.'

461. After a while the aforesaid returned and said that they had looked for him throughout the church but had not found either him or any of his men.

462. The most holy archbishop said: 'Let the deacons Crispinus and Jovian go and look around the church for him again, and wherever they discover him to be, summon him.'

463. They went off, and after returning said that they had not found him but had heard that he was about to present himself along with a large following of soldiers,²³⁶ monks and members of the prefect's staff.

464. When this was said and the holy synod was waiting, the most

236 'Soldiers' refers to members of the imperial service, military or civil.

devout presbyter and advocate John said: 'The most devout presbyter and archimandrite Eutyches has arrived with a large company of soldiers, monks, and officers of the most magnificent and glorious praetorian prefect, and they will not let him enter your holy synod unless we promise in return to release his person. Magnus the most wondrous silentiary is also with him in front of the doors, and wishes to enter as the envoy of our most pious and Christ-loving emperor.'

465. The most holy archbishop said: 'Let them enter.'

466. After their entry the most wondrous silentiary Magnus said: 'By the presence of your holiness receive, if you so bid, the missive of the master. He has sent you clear directions in writing, and if it please you, let it be read.'

467. The holy synod said: 'Read, my child, the instructions of our most pious emperor.'

The most wondrous silentiary Magnus read as follows:

468. *We concern ourselves with the peace of the holy churches and of the orthodox faith, and we wish to see preserved the creed that was proclaimed correctly and under divine inspiration by our fathers the 318 who convened at Nicaea and by those who convened at Ephesus for the deposition of Nestorius. This is our wish, lest harm come to the aforesaid orthodoxy. Since we know that the most magnificent patrician Florentius is a man of faith and proven orthodoxy, we wish him to attend the hearing at the synod, since the discussion is about the faith.*

(Ephesus II)

469. While this was being read the holy council said: 'Many years to the emperor! Great is the faith of the emperors. Many years to the guardians of the faith! Many years to the orthodox emperors! To the pious and orthodox one! To the pious emperor! To the emperor, high priest! Listen, holy fathers. We thank the orthodox emperors.'

(Constantinople)

470. The most holy archbishop said: 'we all know that the lord Florentius is a man of faith and proven orthodoxy, and we wish him to attend; but let us inquire from Eutyches the presbyter whether he wishes him to attend.'

471. Eutyches presbyter and archimandrite said: 'Do whatever God and your holiness wills. I entrust myself to you.'

472. The most holy archbishop said: 'Let the most magnificent patrician Florentius enter. Ask him, my child the silentiary, to be so good.'

473. The most wondrous silentiary Magnus said: 'Give orders for a cleric to be sent with me, to leave him in no doubt that your holiness sent me.'

474. The most holy archbishop said: 'If our most pious emperor had ordered us to send someone, we would have done so. But since he hasn't given the order, go to his magnificence on your own.'

475. When the most magnificent and glorious former consul and former prefect Florentius had entered, the holy synod said: 'Let the accuser and the accused stand in the centre and let the acts be read from the beginning that relate to the case of the most God-beloved Bishop Eusebius and the most devout presbyter and archimandrite Eutyches, so that, guided by our previous sessions, we may give to what is already in process a conclusion that accords both with justice and the holy canons.'

476. Aetius, deacon and notary, came forward to the centre and read the minutes of the acts. In the course of the reading he reached that passage in the second letter of Cyril of divine memory, the one addressed to the most God-beloved bishops of the Orient, which contains these words:²³⁷

We therefore acknowledge our Lord Jesus Christ, the only-begotten Son of God, perfect God and perfect man made up of a rational soul and body, begotten from the Father before the ages in respect of the Godhead and the same on the last day for us and for our salvation from the Virgin Mary in respect of his manhood, the same consubstantial with the Father in respect of the Godhead and consubstantial with us in respect of the manhood. For there has occurred a union of two natures, and therefore we acknowledge one Christ, one Son, one Lord. By virtue of this understanding of the union which involves no merging, we acknowledge the holy Virgin to be Theotokos, because God the Word was enfleshed and became man and from the very conception united to himself the temple taken from her.

477. The most God-beloved Bishop Eusebius said: 'This man, by your feet, doesn't acknowledge this and has never accepted these things,

237 The Formula of Reunion contained in Cyril's Letter to John of Antioch (246 above).

but holds opinions contrary to them which he has expressed to everyone he meets and which he also teaches.'

478. The most magnificent and glorious former prefect, former consul and patrician Florentius said: 'If it please your sacredness, let father Eutyches be asked if he accepts them.'

479. The most God-beloved Bishop Eusebius said: 'Please let the whole text of the minutes be read. The minutes are sufficient to convict him; indeed he is for me convicted already. I ought not to suffer prejudice to my case through his assenting to a definition he had found somewhere. I have proved him guilty, and I can use the testimonies of those who were sent to him by the holy synod and the evidence of most sacred bishops to prove the same again, if he were to deny it. There are the lord Meliphthongus, the lord Jovian and the lord Julian²³⁸ who have precise knowledge of the facts.'

480. The most holy archbishop said: 'No one will deny, Bishop Eusebius, that you have convicted him, and no one will accept the presbyter Eutyches' present assent except on the basis of his conviction for what he held in the past.'

481. The most God-beloved Bishop Eusebius said: 'I fear his machinations. I am poor and without resources. He has threatened me with exile, and is a man of means. He already pictures me in the Oasis.'²³⁹

482. The most holy archbishop said: 'Even if you keep on saying this again and again, we will put nothing before the truth.'

483. Bishop Eusebius said: 'If I am convicted of false accusation, may I be stripped of my rank.'

484. The most magnificent and glorious former prefect, former consul and patrician Florentius said: 'Let the presbyter Eutyches be subjected to interrogation as to what he believes and asserts, and then let him be asked again why, if he asserts these things now, he held different opinions in the past.'

485. Bishop Eusebius said: 'As I have already said, on condition that his present assent does not prejudice my position let him indeed be questioned. For I have already convicted him of unorthodoxy from the minutes of the previous proceedings.'

238 Bishops Meliphthongus of Juliopolis, Jovian of Deultum, and Julian of Cos.

239 The place of exile in Upper Egypt to which Nestorius has been sent in 435. If, through his present confession, Eutyches were to be acquitted of heresy, Eusebius would risk being convicted in his turn for bringing a vexatious prosecution; see Gaudemet 1958, 262–3.

486. The most holy archbishop said: 'His present assent will not prejudice your position. For the proceedings that have already taken place have their own validity.'

487. Bishop Eusebius said: 'Does he assent to what has just been read of the blessed Cyril and acknowledge that there has occurred a union of two natures in one person and one hypostasis,²⁴⁰ or does he not?'

488. The most holy archbishop said: 'You have heard, presbyter Eutyches, what your accuser says. Say then whether you acknowledge a union from two natures.'

489. Eutyches the presbyter said: 'Yes, from two natures.'²⁴¹

490. Bishop Eusebius said: 'Do you acknowledge, lord archimandrite, two natures after the incarnation, and do you say that Christ is consubstantial with us in respect of the flesh or not?'

(Ephesus II)

491. The holy council said: 'Destroy and burn Eusebius. Let him be burnt alive. Let him be cut in two. As he has divided, let him be divided.'

492. Dioscorus bishop of Alexandria said: 'Do you allow this language – speaking of two natures after the incarnation?'

493. The holy council said: 'Anathema to whoever says this!'

494. Dioscorus bishop of Alexandria said: 'Since I need both your voices and a show of hands, let anyone who is unable to cry out raise his hand.'

495. The holy council said: 'Anathema to whoever says two!'

(Chalcedon)

496. During the reading the most devout Oriental bishops and those with them exclaimed: 'No one said this. Dioscorus said it. The Egyptians said it.'

497. The most devout Egyptian bishops said: 'We said it then and we say it now.'

Constantine the hallowed secretary of the divine consistory read from the same document:

240 The formula of two natures, one person, and one hypostasis derives from Flavian's confession of faith, uttered in the second session of the synod (271), and was to be adopted in the Chalcedonian Definition (V. 34).

241 Flavian allows Eutyches to amend 'union of two natures' to 'union from [ἐκ] two natures', in accordance with Flavian's own profession at 271. The preposition 'from' blurs the affirmation of a continuing duality after the union (cf. Dioscorus at 332). But though Eutyches accepts 'from two natures' at this point, he had rejected it previously (359, 451, 456), through a dislike of any expression of duality in Christ, and at 527 he accepts the formula only in the form 'from two natures before the union'.

(Constantinople)

498. Eutyches the presbyter said: 'I did not come here to discuss, but I came to inform your sacredness of what I hold. What I hold has been recorded in this document. Give orders for it be read.'
499. The most holy archbishop said: 'Read it yourself.'
500. Eutyches the presbyter said: 'I am not able to.'
501. The most holy archbishop said: 'Why? Is it really your exposition, or someone else's? If it is yours, read it yourself.'
502. Eutyches the presbyter said: 'The declaration is mine, but the declaration of the holy fathers is the same.'
503. The most holy archbishop said: 'Which fathers? Speak for yourself. Why do you need a document?'

(Ephesus II)

504. During the reading John bishop of Hephæstus said: 'As long as he was absent and not expected to attend the assembly, they made a show of promising him every courtesy;²⁴² but when he presented himself, he was subjected to every inhumanity.'

(Constantinople)

505. Eutyches the presbyter said: 'This is what I believe: I worship the Father with the Son, the Son with the Father, and the Holy Spirit with the Father and the Son; I acknowledge that his coming in the flesh was from the flesh of the Holy Virgin, and that he became man perfectly for our salvation. This I confess before the Father and the Son and the Holy Spirit and before your holiness.'

(Ephesus II)

506. Dioscorus bishop of Alexandria said: 'We accept this declaration.'
507. The holy synod said: 'This is the faith of the fathers.'
508. Dioscorus bishop of Alexandria said: 'When your religiousness says that this is the faith of the fathers, whose faith do you mean? Who expounded it?'
509. The holy synod said: 'Eutyches. For Eusebius is impious.'
510. Dioscorus bishop of Alexandria said: 'You have heard the faith of Eutyches the archimandrite. Note how his meaning has become clear to you all.'

242 See 417 above.

(Constantinople)

511. The most holy archbishop said: 'Do you acknowledge that the same one Son, our Lord Jesus Christ, is consubstantial with his Father in respect of the Godhead and consubstantial with his mother in respect of the manhood?'
512. Eutyches the presbyter said: 'When I presented myself to your holiness, I said what I hold about the Father and the Son and the Holy Spirit. Do not examine me on anything else.'
513. The most holy archbishop said: 'Do you now acknowledge "from two natures"?''
514. Eutyches the presbyter said: 'Since I acknowledge my God and my Lord as Lord of heaven and earth, I have not till today allowed myself to inquire into his nature. But although up till now I have not described him as consubstantial with us, I now acknowledge it.'
515. The most holy archbishop said: 'Do you not say that he is consubstantial with the Father in respect of the Godhead and the same consubstantial with us in respect of the manhood?'
516. Eutyches the presbyter said: 'Till today I have not said that the body of our Lord and God is consubstantial with us, but I acknowledge that the Holy Virgin is consubstantial with us, and that our God was enfleshed from her.'
517. The most holy archbishop said: 'So the Virgin from whom Christ the Lord was enfleshed is consubstantial with us?'
518. Eutyches the presbyter said: 'I have said that the Virgin is consubstantial with us.'
519. The most God-beloved Bishop Basil said: 'If his mother is consubstantial with us, so is he; for he was called son of man. If then his mother is consubstantial with us, then he too is consubstantial with us in respect of the flesh.'
520. Eutyches the presbyter said: 'Since you now say so, I agree with it all.'
521. The most magnificent and glorious former prefect, former consul and patrician Florentius said: 'Since the mother is consubstantial with us, then most certainly the son too is consubstantial with us.'
522. Eutyches the presbyter said: 'Till today I did not say this. Because I acknowledge it to be the body of God – are you attending? –, I did not say that the body of God is the body of a man, but that the body is human and that the Lord was enfleshed from the Virgin. If one must say that he is from the Virgin and so consubstantial with us,

then I say this also, my lord, with the reservation that he is the only-begotten Son of God, Lord of heaven and earth, ruling and reigning with the Father, with whom he is also enthroned and glorified; for I do not say "consubstantial" in such a way as to deny that he is the Son of God. Before I did not say this of him; I am saying to you what, I think, I did not say originally. But now, since your sacredness has said it, I say it.'

523. The most holy archbishop said: 'So you confess the true faith out of compulsion rather than conviction?'

524. Eutyches the presbyter said: 'For the time being, my lord, be satisfied with this. Up till this hour I was afraid to say this, since I acknowledge the Lord our God, and I did not allow myself to inquire into his nature. But since your sacredness enjoins it and teaches it, I say it.'

525. The most holy archbishop said: 'We are not making an innovation, but the fathers defined this. And since our faith accords with the faith they defined, we wish everyone to abide by it and no one to innovate.'

526. The most magnificent and glorious patrician Florentius said: 'Do you say, or not, that our Lord who is from the Virgin is consubstantial [with us] and from two natures after the incarnation?'

527. Eutyches the presbyter said: 'I acknowledge that our Lord came into being from two natures before the union; but after the union I acknowledge one nature.'

(Ephesus II)

528. Dioscorus bishop of Alexandria said: 'We all agree with this.'

529. The holy synod said: 'We agree.'

(Chalcedon)

530. During the reading the most devout Oriental bishops and those with them exclaimed: 'No one said this. Anathema to whoever said it. The murderer said this. The Egyptians said this. This is of Pharaoh. Anathema to those who said this. This is of Dioscorus. This is of the murderer. What further inquiry is needed? [Report] our acclamations to the emperor. Many years to the emperor! Many years to the Augusta! Many years to the senate!'

531. Eustathius the most devout bishop of Berytus said: 'The aim of the most pious emperor, the aim of the most pious Augusta, and your aim, is to unite the churches. Take care lest after our departure some people begin to

say that it was defined that one must speak of two separated natures after the union.'

532. While he was speaking, Basil the most devout bishop of Seleucia in Isauria said: 'We acknowledge the two natures but we do not divide them. We do not speak of them as either divided or blended.'

533. The most glorious officials and the exalted senate said: 'Proceed through the rest.'

Constantine the hallowed secretary of the divine consistory read from the same document:

(Constantinople)

534. The holy synod said: 'You must make a clear confession of faith and anathematize everything contrary to the doctrines that have been read.'

535. Eutyches the presbyter said: 'I have said to your sacredness that I did not say this before; but now, since your sacredness teaches it, I say it and follow the fathers. But I have not found it clearly stated in the scriptures, nor did all the fathers say it. If I anathematize, woe is me, because I anathematize my fathers.'²⁴³

536. The holy synod rose and exclaimed: 'Anathema to him!'

537. After this the most holy archbishop said: 'Let the holy synod say what is deserved by a defendant who neither confesses the orthodox faith clearly nor is prepared to accede to the doctrine of the present holy synod, but persists in his twisted and wicked perversity.'

538. Seleucus the most God-beloved bishop of Amaseia said: 'He deserves to be deposed, but it depends solely on the mercy of your holiness.'

539. The most holy archbishop said: 'If he were to acknowledge his fault and consent to anathematize his doctrine and to agree with us who follow the definitions of the holy fathers, then he would reasonably deserve forgiveness. But since he persists in his lawlessness, he will incur the penalties of the canons.'

540. Eutyches the presbyter said: 'I say these things, since you have now ordered it, but I am not ready to anathematize. What I am saying, I am saying in accordance with the truth.'

²⁴³ According to testimony given at the examination of the minutes at the meeting in April 449 (at 788), Eutyches made this last remark in response to a demand by Archbishop Flavian that he accept two natures after the union.

541. The most magnificent and glorious former prefect, former consul and patrician Florentius said: 'Do you affirm "two natures" and "consubstantial with us". Speak!'

542. Eutyches the presbyter said: 'I have read in the blessed Cyril, in the holy fathers and in Saint Athanasius that they said "from two natures" before the union, but after the union and the incarnation they no longer affirmed two natures but one.'²⁴⁴

543. The most magnificent and glorious former prefect, former consul and patrician Florentius said: 'Do you acknowledge two natures after the union? Speak! If you do not, you will be deposed.'

544. Eutyches the presbyter said: 'Have the writings of Saint Athanasius read. Then you will discover that he says nothing of the kind.'

545. The most God-beloved Bishop Basil said: 'If you do not affirm two natures after the incarnation, you imply mixture and confusion.'

(Ephesus II)

546. The same Basil bishop of Seleucia in Isauria rose and said: 'This statement that they say I made I did not make in these words. I am not aware of having said this; but when the monk said, "I say that the Lord Jesus Christ is from two natures, but after the union I affirm one nature" – without the addition of "enfleshed and made man" – I remember that I said, "If you say 'from two natures' but after the union say 'one nature', without adding 'enfleshed and made man', you incur the suspicion of implying confusion and mixture; but if you add 'enfleshed and made man', you say the same as our fathers, for it is clear that according to the teaching of the fathers his Godhead, that is, of the one Lord Jesus Christ, is one thing and the flesh from his mother another.'²⁴⁵

547. Juvenal bishop of Jerusalem said: 'Was your statement altered?'

548. Basil bishop of Seleucia said: 'I have no memory or knowledge of having made it.'

244 Cf. Cyril in his First Letter to Succensus, 'We do not wrong the concurrence into unity when we say that he came into being from two natures; but after the union we do not separate the natures from each other nor do we sever the one and indivisible into two sons, but we say one Son and, as the fathers have said, one incarnate nature of the Word' (*Select Letters*, 74–6). The similar statements in Athanasius are Apollinarian forgeries.

245 Cf. 791, where at a hearing at Constantinople in April 449 Basil gives the same account. The authenticity of the account is established by testimony that Eusebius of Dorylaeum reacted angrily to Basil's intervention (754, 798).

(Constantinople)

549. The most magnificent and glorious Florentius said: 'He who does not say "from two natures" and "two natures" is not orthodox in his beliefs.'²⁴⁶

550. All²⁴⁷ the holy synod rose and exclaimed: 'Faith under compulsion is not faith. Many years to the emperors! To the orthodox emperors many years! Your faith is always victorious. He does not assent; why try to persuade him?'

551. The most holy archbishop said: 'Eutyches, formerly presbyter and archimandrite, is revealed in every way, by both his past actions and his present testimony, to be riddled with the heresies of Valentinus and Apollinarius²⁴⁸ and to be incorrigible in following their blasphemies. Scorning our exhortation and teaching, he has refused to assent to the orthodox doctrines. For this reason, as we moan and weep for his total perdition, we have decreed in the name of our Lord Jesus Christ, whom he has blasphemed, that he is deprived of all sacerdotal rank, of communion with us, and of the headship of a monastery. All persons who in future speak with him or visit him are informed that they too will incur the penalty of excommunication for failing to avoid his company.'

552. (1) Flavian bishop of Constantinople Rome, I have given my sentence and signed.

(2) Saturninus bishop of Marcianopolis, I have given my sentence and signed.

(3) Basil bishop of Seleucia in Isauria, I have given my sentence and signed.

(4) Seleucus by the grace of Christ bishop of Amaseia in Helenopontus, I have given my sentence and signed.

(5) Eulalius bishop of Chalcedon, I have given my sentence and signed.

246 At the meeting to examine the minutes in April 449 Florentius denied having said this (778), while admitting (776) having uttered the equally partisan statement at 543.

247 Rusticus, commenting on the quotation of this paragraph in the minutes of the hearing of 13 April 449 (at 783), writes, 'Here the Greek codices have in error "all the holy synod", for in the preceding acts, where this session is first included, "all" does not occur.' Schwartz accordingly queries the word; but it does in fact occur in all our MSS apart from those of Rusticus' edition.

248 Valentinus (or at least some Valentinians) denied Christ a physical body, while Apollinarius denied him a human mind. Flavian uses their names loosely to categorize Eutyches as a heretic whose doctrine of the manhood of Christ was radically defective.

- (6) Timothy bishop [of Arca], I have given my sentence and signed.
- (7) Dorotheus by the mercy of God bishop of Neocaesarea, I read, agreed and signed.
- (8) Aetherichus bishop of Smyrna, I have given my sentence. If anyone holds views on the faith that differ from the definitions of the entire holy council at Nicaea, let him be anathema.
- (9) Callinicus bishop of Apamea in Bithynia, I have given my sentence and signed.
- (10) Cecropius by the mercy of God bishop of Sebastopolis, I have given my sentence and signed.
- (11) Meliphthongus by the mercy of God bishop of the holy church of God at Juliopolis, I have given my sentence and signed.
- (12) Longinus by the mercy of God bishop of Chersonesus, I have given my sentence and signed.
- (13) Trypho bishop of the church of God of the city of Chios of the Islands, I have given my sentence and signed in my own hand.
- (14) Paul bishop of the holy church of the city of Apollonia, I have given my sentence and signed. He who inflicts blows on himself is spared by no one.
- (15) Sabas bishop of Paltus, I have given my sentence and signed with my own hand.
- (16) Jovian bishop of Deultum, I have given my sentence and signed.
- (17) Julian the most insignificant bishop of Cos, I have given my sentence and signed.
- (18) Sabinianus bishop of the holy church of God at Termessus, Eudocias and Jovia, I have given my sentence and signed.
- (19) Eustochius by the mercy of God bishop of the holy church of Docimium, I have given my sentence and signed.
- (20) Pionius the most insignificant bishop of the holy church of God at Troas, I have given my sentence and signed.
- (21) Cossinius the most insignificant bishop of the city of Hierocaesarea, I have given my sentence and signed.
- (22) John the most insignificant bishop of the city of Hyrcanis, I have given my sentence and signed.
- (23) Diapherontius bishop of the city of Olba, I have given my sentence and signed.

- (24) Julian bishop of the city of Mostene, I have given my sentence and signed.
- (25) Romanus bishop of Eudoxiopolis, I have given my sentence and signed.
- (26) Eudoxius bishop of the city of Bosphorus, I have signed, giving my sentence through the presbyter Basiliscus.
- (27) Thomas the most insignificant bishop of Valentinianopolis, I have given my sentence and signed.
- (28) Aurelius bishop of Puppit,²⁴⁹ I have signed.
- (29) Timothy bishop of Primupolis, I have given my sentence and signed.
- (30) Genethlius bishop of Argos, I have signed.
- (31)²⁵⁰ Andrew, presbyter and archimandrite, I have signed through the presbyter Timothy the deposition of Eutyches.
- (32) Faustus presbyter and archimandrite, I have signed the deposition of Eutyches the former presbyter and archimandrite.
- (33) Martin presbyter and archimandrite of the monastery of the blessed Dios,²⁵¹ I have signed through brother Philip the deposition of Eutyches the former presbyter and archimandrite.
- (34) Manuel presbyter and archimandrite, I have signed the deposition of Eutyches.
- (35) Peter presbyter and archimandrite of the monastery of the blessed Thalassius,²⁵² I have signed through Theodore the monk the deposition of Eutyches the former presbyter and archimandrite.
- (36) Job presbyter and archimandrite, I have signed through my deacon Andrew the deposition of Eutyches.
- (37) Antiochus presbyter and archimandrite of the monastery of the blessed Theotecnus, I have signed the deposition of Eutyches.

249 A see in Africa Proconsularis. Aurelius was in all probability a refugee from the Vandal occupation.

250 There follow the signatures of the archimandrites of Constantinople, who were made, after the synod, to add their signatures to Eutyches' condemnation, as Eutyches complained in his plaint to the Council of Ephesus (185).

251 The monastery of Dios was one of the oldest monasteries of Constantinople, founded late in the fourth century and located between the Constantinian and Theodosian walls (Janin 1969, 97-9). The epithet 'blessed' in this and following entries designates a founding monk who had died.

252 See Janin 1969, 140 for the history of this monastery of unknown location.

- (38) Abramius presbyter and archimandrite, I have signed the deposition of Eutyches.
- (39) Theodore monk and archimandrite, I have signed the deposition of Eutyches.
- (40) Theodore presbyter and archimandrite of the Egyptians,²⁵³ I have signed the deposition of Eutyches.
- (41) Pientius presbyter and archimandrite of the martyrdom of the Infants,²⁵⁴ I have signed the deposition of Eutyches.
- (42) Flavian archimandrite of the monastery of the holy Hermaus, I have signed the deposition of Eutyches.
- (43) Eusebius presbyter and archimandrite of the monastery of Helias,²⁵⁵ I have signed the deposition of Eutyches.
- (44) Eusebius presbyter and archimandrite of the monastery of the holy Eulogius, I have signed through my deacon Theodulus the deposition of Eutyches.
- (45) Trypho archimandrite, I have signed the deposition of Eutyches.
- (46) James deacon and archimandrite of the Syrians,²⁵⁶ I have signed through my monk Zoticus the deposition of Eutyches.
- (47) Helpidius presbyter and archimandrite, I have signed the deposition of Eutyches.
- (48) Paul presbyter and archimandrite of Aethrium, I have signed the deposition of Eutyches.
- (49) Carosus presbyter and archimandrite, I have signed the deposition of Eutyches.
- (50) Asterius presbyter and archimandrite of the monastery of the blessed Laurence, I have signed the deposition of Eutyches.
- (51) Callinicus monk and archimandrite of the monastery of Theodotus, I have signed the deposition of Eutyches.
- (52) Germanus presbyter and archimandrite, I have signed through the deacon Glycerius the deposition of Eutyches.

²⁵³ This monastery was located in the Blachernae quarter, in the extreme north of the city (Janin 1969, 12). Egyptian monks can only have signed Eutyches' condemnation under episcopal pressure.

²⁵⁴ Located just beyond Hebdomon, south-west from the city (Janin 1969, 366).

²⁵⁵ A monastery of Syrian monks, of unknown location (Janin 1969, 136-7).

²⁵⁶ This, like the monasteries of Aethrium and Theodotus named below (§§48, 51), is a monastery of unknown location that reappears in sixth-century sources (Janin 1969, 479-80, 338, 146 respectively).

- (53) Marcellus the most insignificant presbyter and archimandrite,²⁵⁷ I have signed the deposition of Eutyches with my own hand. All fifty-three signed.

(Ephesus II)

553. The archimandrite Eutyches said: 'Some parts of the minutes that have been read have been falsified. There are proceedings relating to this, and I request that they be read.'

554. Juvenal bishop of Jerusalem said: 'Let them be received and read, and be included in the minutes of the proceedings.'

John presbyter and protonotary read:

(Constantinople, 13 April 449)

555. Copy of the minutes drawn up by divine order at Constantinople on the Ides of April in the consulship of Flavius Protogenes and the one to be designated.

There were seated in the Great Portico of the most holy church: (1) Flavian the most devout bishop of this glorious city, (2) the most magnificent Florentius, former prefect of the city, former praetorian prefect for the sixth time,²⁵⁸ former consul and patrician, (3) Thalassius the most devout bishop of the city of Caesarea in the province of Cappadocia, (4) Eusebius the most devout bishop of the city of Ancyra, (5) Seleucus the most devout bishop of the city of Amaseia, (6) Basil the most devout bishop of the city of Seleucia in the province of Isauria, (7) Alexander the most devout bishop of the city of Tomi in the province of Scythia, (8) Marinianus the most devout bishop of the city of Synnada, (9) Meliphthongus the most devout bishop of the city of Juliopolis, (10) Acacius the most devout bishop of the city of Ariaratheia, (11) Proclus the most devout bishop of the city of Adraa, (12) Daniel the most devout bishop of the city of Cadi, (13) Sabas the most devout bishop of the city of Paltus, (14) Longinus the most devout bishop of the city of Chersonesus, (15) John the most devout bishop of the city of Bargylia in the province of Caria, (16) Paulinus the most devout bishop of the city of Theodosiopolis in the

²⁵⁷ Marcellus was the archimandrite of the famous monastery of the Acoemetae near the north-east tip of the city (Janin 1969, 16-17). He was an ally of Theodore of Cyrrhus, who sent him *epp.* 142-3 in the wake of Ephesus II.

²⁵⁸ Florentius' six tenures of the post of praetorian prefect are also referred to at 557 and in the Latin Acts at 2.8. Only two are known from other sources; see *PLRE* 2, 479.